

Charlotte Bell
Carat
Raeburn House
32 York Place
Edinburgh
EH1 3HU

9 May 2016

**MEDIA PLANNING, BUYING AND ASSOCIATED SERVICES FRAMEWORK – REF(SP-14-03)
PROVISION OF MEDIA BUYING AND PLANNING FOR THE FOOD STANDARDS SCOTLAND**

Thank you for your tender for the above requirement.

Having evaluated all the tenders received in response to the mini-competition for this contract, I am writing, on behalf of Food Standards Scotland, to inform you that on this occasion your tender has not been successful. The contract has been awarded to Republic of Media Ltd.

The table below shows the individual scores given against the published criteria in respect of your submission and those of the winning tenderer.

Criteria	Criteria Weighting	Carat	Winning Tenderer
1 – General Understanding of Requirement	30%	26.25	26.25
2 – Expertise and Experience	10%	10	8.75
3 – Operational Proposal	60%	45.00	60.00
Overall Quality Score		81.25	95
Quality Score award (30:70 Quality/Price Ratio)		56.88	66.50
Commercial Score award; (30:70 Quality/Price Ratio)		30.00	26.50
Total Score		86.88	93.00

I have attached an annex which provides a debrief of you tender relative to the winning tenderer.

May I take this opportunity to once again thank you for your interest in this contract. Other contracting opportunities from the Scottish public sector can be found on the Public Contracts Scotland portal.

Yours sincerely

Tommy McPhelim
Senior Portfolio Specialist
on behalf of
Food Standards Scotland

Criterion	Carat	Winning Tenderer
Understanding the Requirement	Showed a very comprehensive understanding of FSS' strategy and plans, and of the key challenges and opportunities facing FSS. Also gave insight into the macro media environment and how this might affect FSS' media strategy.	Demonstrated excellent understanding of FSS' areas of interest, role and remit. Good understanding of current FSS work with the "4 Cs" and "Eat Well Guide" and related them to our requirements. Clear capacity and availability to meet needs.
Expertise and Experience	Clearly showed a strong background in public sector and behaviour change media planning and buying. Some good case studies with excellent results, offering idea of ROI. Team proposed seemed very large for FSS's requirements, although clearly the core team would be the day-to-day contact – this led to a slight concern that FSS would be too small an organisation and the team would be focused on many other clients. Detailed profiles on each staff member detracted a little from the key points of the document. However, experience of the team unquestioned.	Proposed a strong team, with a good range of relevant experience and expertise and sufficient senior input and support. Very clear lines of responsibility and contacts. Limited use of case studies, however clear detail of previous projects each member of the team has worked on.
Operational Proposal	Strong strategy based on surrounding the discretionary food journey to achieve cut-through. Some very useful and relevant insight. High TVRs and a strong overall plan: however not a great deal of emphasis on social media, and radio chose over outdoor despite outdoor scoring higher amongst our target audience.	Very insightful response to the Healthy Eating campaign brief. Demonstrated understanding of the key issues the campaign faces, with a strong insight into the target audience and 'snacking moments of weakness', and a strategy and plans with a very strong rationale backing up the recommendations. Channel selection made sense and the identification of the 'tipping point' where excessive TV frequency leads to wastage was particularly helpful and demonstrated the agency would help FSS make best, most cost-effective use of media spend. Digital recommendations were well thought out, with supporting rationale and an innovative approach.

